

1 [Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

11 IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
12 ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY
13 PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL No. 3047

Case No. 4:22-03047-YGR

14 This Document Relates to:
15 ALL ACTIONS

**OMNIBUS SEALING STIPULATION
PURSUANT TO THE ORDER GRANTING
MOTION TO FILE UNDER SEAL;
SETTING SEALING PROCEDURES
FOR ECF 904**

18 Pursuant to the Court's Order Granting Motion to File Under Seal; Setting Sealing
19 Procedures ("Sealing Procedures Order") (ECF 341), the Parties, through their undersigned
20 counsel, hereby submit this Omnibus Sealing Stipulation.

21 The Parties declare in support of this Stipulation:

22 1. In accordance with Section II of the Sealing Procedures Order, entitled Post-
23 Briefing Omnibus Sealing Procedures, the Parties have met and conferred regarding the Parties'
24 proposed sealing and redactions in the Defendants' Amended Notice of Replacement Personal
25 Injury Bellwether Discovery Pool Selections (ECF 904) filed on May 28, 2024.

26 2. In accordance with the Sealing Procedures Order, the Parties have created the
27 attached Chart listing the portion of the Defendants' Notice of Replacement Personal Injury

28

1 Bellwether Discovery Pool Selections (ECF 899) and Defendants' Amended Notice of
 2 Replacement Personal Injury Bellwether Discovery Pool Selections (ECF 904) to be redacted.

3 3. The Parties have limited proposed redactions to Protected Health Information as
 4 defined by the Parties' Stipulated Second Modified Protective Order. (ECF 665).

5 4. In addition, the Parties have limited proposed redactions to materials that are not
 6 currently on the public docket.

7 5. Plaintiffs state the following:

8 a. Protected Health Information ("PHI"): "has the meaning set forth in 45
 9 C.F.R. §§ 160.103 and 164.501...and includes but is not limited to individually identifiable health
 10 information, including demographic information, relating to either (a) the past, present, or future
 11 physical or mental condition of an individual; (b) the provision of health care to an individual..."
 12 Stipulated Second Modified Protective Order. ECF No. 665.

13 b. In *A.C. v. City of Santa Clara*, No. 13-CV-03276-HSG, 2015 WL 4076364,
 14 at *2 (N.D. Cal. July 2, 2015), Judge Gilliam found that when it comes to medical records,
 15 "compelling confidentiality concerns outweigh the presumption of public access to court
 16 records." *See Dalton v. Cnty. of San Diego*, No. 3:21-CV-2143 W (WVG), 2024 WL 1319719, at
 17 *1 (S.D. Cal. Mar. 27, 2024) (to the extent the exhibits identify a minor and implicate her
 18 criminal and mental health history, the documents may be sealed.); *San Ramon Reg'l Med. Ctr., Inc. v. Principal Life Ins. Co.*, No. 10-cv-02258-SBA, 2011 WL 89931, at *1 n.1 (N.D.Cal. Jan. 10, 2011) (finding that confidentiality of medical records under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 outweighed *Kamakana* presumption in favor of public access to court records); *Ballou v. McElvain*, No. 3:19-CV-05002-DGE, 2023 WL 8236530, at *2 (W.D. Wash. Nov. 28, 2023) (concluding that there is great need to protect sensitive medical information from public disclosure such as plaintiff's mental state, including mental health symptoms). *See also Liaw v. United Airlines, Inc.*, No. 19-CV-00396-WHA, 2019 WL 6251204, at *10 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 22, 2019) (private medical records sealed under higher 'compelling reason' standard); *Pratt v. Gamboa*, No. 17-CV-04375-LHK, 2020 WL 8992141, at *2 (N.D. Cal. May 22, 2020). ('compelling reasons' justify sealing Plaintiff's medical records which are deemed

1 confidential under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996); *Bruce v.*
 2 *Azar*, 389 F. Supp. 3d 716, 727 (N.D. Cal. 2019), aff'd, 826 F. App'x 643 (9th Cir. 2020) (courts
 3 have found under 'compelling reason' standard that a party's privacy interests in medical records
 4 and private information outweigh the public's interest in access.); *Woods v. City of Hayward*, No.
 5 19-CV-01350-JCS, 2021 WL 4061657, at *20 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 7, 2021) (to the extent proposed
 6 redactions are based on medical privacy, privacy interests related to juvenile correctional records,
 7 or the privacy protections of Rule 5.2, plaintiff has shown 'compelling reasons' to maintain that
 8 material under seal and his requests are narrowly tailored). *See also In re Flint Water Cases*, No.
 9 517CV10164JELMKM, 2021 WL 2254064, at *2 (E.D. Mich. May 20, 2021) (private medical
 10 information of the bellwether plaintiffs, identifying information of minors, and addresses of
 11 minor plaintiffs, all is appropriate to redact and/or seal).

12 c. PHI, which is already subject to the Stipulated Second Modified Protective
 13 Order, should remain sealed in the Defendants' Amended Notice of Replacement Personal Injury
 14 Bellwether Discovery Pool Selections, including the statistical analysis and narratives detailing
 15 specific "past, present, or future physical or mental conditions" and "the provision of health care"
 16 such as hospitalizations. *See* ECF No. 665. The bellwether plaintiffs, all of whom were injured as
 17 minors, should be protected from any potential embarrassment resulting from having their PHI
 18 linked to their identities as recognized by this Court and well-established Ninth Circuit precedent.

19 6. Defendants' position is that Plaintiffs' medical histories are not subject to absolute
 20 protection, given that Plaintiffs have put those medical histories at issue by filing these lawsuits.
 21 *See, e.g., Howard v. Cox*, 2021 WL 4487603, at *2 (D. Nev. Sept. 30, 2021) (sealing medical
 22 records but declining to "require the parties to redact the parts of those records that they quote or
 23 paraphrase in their briefs because those points are relevant to [plaintiff's] claims in this action");
 24 *Cole v. Janssen Pharms., Inc.*, No. 15-CV-57, 2017 WL 2929523, at *3 (E.D. Wis. July 10, 2017)
 25 ("To the extent that the information from the medical records is incorporated into other
 26 documents filed by the parties or orders issued by this court, that information is relevant to the
 27 issues raised in the case and should be available to the public."). Nonetheless, to obviate the need
 28 for the Court to address a sealing dispute, Defendants agree to seal certain material from these

1 briefs without prejudice to their ability to argue that such material should be unsealed in
 2 subsequent filings.

3 THEREFORE, in accordance with the Sealing Procedures Order, the Parties stipulate and
 4 respectfully request that the Court accept their undisputed requests to maintain the redactions in
 5 the Defendants' Amended Notice of Replacement Personal Injury Bellwether Discovery Pool
 6 Selections (ECF 899) and Defendants' Amended Notice of Replacement Personal Injury
 7 Bellwether Discovery Pool Selections (ECF 904), as set forth in attached Chart and the duly
 8 submitted Proposed Order Addressing All Undisputed Sealing Requests emailed to the Court's
 9 proposed order inbox.

10 **IT IS SO STIPULATED AND AGREED**

11 DATED: June 7, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

By: /s/ Lexi J. Hazam

LEXI J. HAZAM

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 BATTERY STREET, 29TH FLOOR
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339

Telephone: 415-956-1000

lhazam@lchb.com

PREVIN WARREN
MOTLEY RICE LLC
401 9th Street NW Suite 630
Washington DC 20004
Telephone: 202-386-9610
pwarren@motleyrice.com

Co-Lead Counsel

CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER
SEEGER WEISS, LLP
55 CHALLENGER ROAD, 6TH FLOOR
RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660
Telephone: 973-639-9100
cseeger@seegerweiss.com

Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel

1 JENNIE LEE ANDERSON
2 **ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP**
3 155 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 900
4 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104
5 Telephone: 415-986-1400
jennie@andrusanderson.com

6 Liaison Counsel

7 EMILY C. JEFFCOTT
8 **MORGAN & MORGAN**
9 633 WEST FIFTH STREET, SUITE 2652
LOS ANGELES, CA 90071
Telephone: 213-787-8590
ejeffcott@forthepeople.com

10 JOSEPH VANZANDT
11 **BEASLEY ALLEN**
12 234 COMMERCE STREET
13 MONTGOMERY, LA 36103
14 Telephone: 334-269-2343
joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

15 Federal/State Liaisons

16 MATTHEW BERGMAN
17 GLENN DRAPER
18 **SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER**
19 821 SECOND AVENUE, SUITE 2100
SEATTLE, WA 98104
Telephone: 206-741-4862
matt@socialmediavictims.org
glenng@socialmediavictims.org

20
21 JAMES J. BILSBORROW
22 **WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC**
23 700 BROADWAY
24 NEW YORK, NY 10003
Telephone: 212-558-5500
jbilsborrow@weitzlux.com

25
26 JAYNE CONROY
27 **SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC**
28 112 MADISON AVE, 7TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10016
Telephone: 917-882-5522
jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

1
2 ANDRE MURA
3 **GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP**
4 1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 2100
5 OAKLAND, CA 94607
6 Telephone: 510-350-9717
7 amm@classlawgroup.com
8
9

10 ALEXANDRA WALSH
11 **WALSH LAW**
12 1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500
13 Washington D.C. 20036
14 Telephone: 202-780-3014
15 awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com
16
17

18 MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ
19 **LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP**
20 510 WALNUT STREET
21 SUITE 500
22 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
23 Telephone: 215-592-1500
24 mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com
25
26

27 Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Leadership
28

1 RON AUSTIN
2 **RON AUSTIN LAW**
3 400 MANHATTAN BLVD.
4 HARVEY, LA 70058
5 Telephone: 504-227-8100
6 raustin@ronaustinlaw.com
7
8

9 PAIGE BOLDT
10 **WALSH LAW**
11 4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100
12 San Antonio, TX 78257
13 Telephone: 210-448-0500
14 PBoldt@alexwalshlaw.com
15
16

17 THOMAS P. CARTMELL
18 **WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP**
19 4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300
20 Kansas City, MO 64112
21 Telephone: 816-701-1100
22 tcartmell@wcllp.com
23
24

1 SARAH EMERY
2 **HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**
3 600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
4 LOUISVILLE, KT 40202
5 Telephone: 859-600-6725
6 semery@justicestartshere.com

7 CARRIE GOLDBERG
8 **C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC**
9 16 Court St.
10 Brooklyn, NY 11241
11 Telephone: 646-666-8908
12 carrie@cagoldberglaw.com

13 RONALD E. JOHNSON, JR.
14 **HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**
15 600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
16 LOUISVILLE, KT 40202
17 Telephone: 859-578-4444
18 rjohnson@justicestartshere.com

19 SIN-TING MARY LIU
20 **AYLSTOCK WITKIN KREIS &**
21 **OVERHOLTZ, PLLC**
22 17 EAST MAIN STREET, SUITE 200
23 PENSACOLA, FL 32502
24 Telephone: 510-698-9566
25 mliu@awkolaw.com

26 JAMES R. MARSH
27 **MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC**
28 31 HUDSON YARDS, 11TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10001-2170
Telephone: 212-372-3030
jamesmarsh@marsh.law

**JOSEPH E. MELTER
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK
LLP
280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
jmeltzer@ktmc.com**

HILLARY NAPPI
HACH & ROSE LLP
112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10016
Telephone: 212-213-8311
hnappi@hrsclaw.com

EMMIE PAULOS
LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY
316 SOUTH BAYLEN STREET, SUITE 600
PENSACOLA, FL 32502
Telephone: 850-435-7107
epoulos@levinlaw.com

RUTH THI RIZKALLA
THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, PC
1500 ROSECRANS AVE., STE. 500
MANHATTAN BEACH, CA 90266
Telephone: 415-308-1915
rrizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com

ROLAND TELLIS
DAVID FERNANDES
BARON & BUDD, P.C.
15910 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 1600
Encino, CA 91436
Telephone: 818-839-2333
rtellis@baronbudd.com
dfernandes@baronbudd.com

**MELISSA YEATES
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK
LLP
280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
myeates@ktmc.com**

DIANDRA "FU" DEBROSSE
ZIMMERMANN
DICELLO LEVITT
505 20th St North
Suite 1500
Birmingham, Alabama 35203
Telephone: 205-855-5700
fu@dicelollevitt.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Membership

Attorneys for Individual Plaintiffs

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen
Ashley M. Simonsen, SBN 275203
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
1999 Avenue of the Stars
Los Angeles, CA 90067
Telephone: (424) 332-4800
Facsimile: + 1 (424) 332-4749
Email: asimonsen@cov.com

Phyllis A. Jones, *pro hac vice*
Paul W. Schmidt, *pro hac vice*
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
One City Center
850 Tenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20001-4956
Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000
Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291
Email: pajones@cov.com

*Attorney for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.
f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings,
LLC; Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook
Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC;
Instagram, LLC; Siculus, Inc.; and Mark Elliot
Zuckerberg*

1 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP
 2 By: /s/ Andrea Roberts Pierson
 3 Andrea Roberts Pierson, *pro hac vice*
 4 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP
 5 300 N. Meridian Street, Suite 2500
 6 Indianapolis, IN 46204
 7 Telephone: + 1 (317) 237-0300
 8 Facsimile: + 1 (317) 237-1000
 9 Email: andrea.pierson@faegredrinker.com
 10 Email: amy.fiterman @faegredrinker.com

11 Amy R. Fiterman, *pro hac vice*
 12 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP
 13 2200 Wells Fargo Center
 14 90 South Seventh Street
 15 Minneapolis, MN 55402
 16 Telephone: +1 (612) 766-7768
 17 Facsimile: +1 (612) 766-1600
 18 Email: amy.fiterman@faegredrinker.com

19 Geoffrey Drake, *pro hac vice*
 20 KING & SPALDING LLP
 21 1180 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 1600
 22 Atlanta, GA 30309
 23 Tel.: 404-572-4600
 24 Email: gd Drake@kslaw.com
 25 Email: dmattern@kslaw.com

26 David Mattern, *pro hac vice*
 27 KING & SPALDING LLP
 28 1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 900
 29 Washington, D.C. 20006
 30 Telephone: +1 (202) 626-2946
 31 Email: dmattern@kslaw.com

32 *Attorneys for Defendants TikTok Inc. and*
 33 *ByteDance Inc.*

34 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSEN LLP
 35 By: /s/ Jonathan H. Blavin
 36 Jonathan H. Blavin, SBN 230269
 37 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
 38 560 Mission Street, 27th Floor
 39 San Francisco, CA 94105-3089
 40 Telephone: (415) 512-4000
 41 Facsimile: (415) 512-4077
 42 Email: jonathan.blavin@mto.com

1 Rose L. Ehler (SBN 29652)
 2 Victoria A. Degtyareva (SBN 284199)
 3 Laura M. Lopez, (SBN 313450)
 4 Ariel T. Teshuva (SBN 324238)
 5 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
 6 350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor
 7 Los Angeles, CA 90071-3426
 8 Telephone: (213) 683-9100
 9 Facsimile: (213) 687-3702
 10 Email: rose.ehler@mto.com
 11 Email: victoria.degtyareva@mto.com
 12 Email: Ariel.Teshuva@mto.com

13 Lauren A. Bell (*pro hac vice forthcoming*)
 14 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
 15 601 Massachusetts Ave., NW St.,
 16 Suite 500 E
 17 Washington, D.C. 20001-5369
 18 Telephone: (202) 220-1100
 19 Facsimile: (202) 220-2300
 20 Email: lauren.bell@mto.com

21 *Attorneys for Defendant Snap Inc.*

22 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
 23 Professional Corporation
 24 By: /s/ Brian M. Willen
 25 Brian M. Willen
 26 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
 27 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor
 28 New York, New York 10019
 Telephone: (212) 999-5800
 Facsimile: (212) 999-5899
Email: bwillen@wsgr.com

1 Lauren Gallo White
 2 Samantha A. Machock
 3 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
 4 One Market Plaza, Spear Tower, Suite 3300
 5 San Francisco, CA 94105
 6 Telephone: (415) 947-2000
 7 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099
 8 Email: lwhite@wsgr.com
Email: smachock@wsgr.com

1 Christopher Chiou
2 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
3 633 West Fifth Street
4 Los Angeles, CA 90071-2048
5 Telephone: (323) 210-2900
6 Facsimile: (866) 974-7329
7 Email: cchiou@wsgr.com

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

*Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC,
Google LLC, and Alphabet Inc.*

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
By: /s/ Joseph G. Petrosinelli
Joseph G. Petrosinelli
jpetrosinelli@wc.com
Ashley W. Hardin
ahardin@wc.com
680 Maine Avenue, SW
Washington, DC 20024
Telephone.: 202-434-5000
Fax: 202-434-5029

*Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC, Google
LLC, and Alphabet Inc.*

1 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED**

2
3 Dated _____

4 Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28